



Outsourcing Strategies and Organizational Performance in Manufacturing Firms in South-East, Nigeria

¹Obikezie, Blessing Ngozi & Goodfaith Nnene Dike²,

**Department of Business Administration,
Faculty of Management Sciences,
Chukwuemeka Odumegwu Ojukwu University Igbariam Campus, Anambra State, Nigeria
Email: dikegoodfaith@gmail.com**

ABSTRACT

The study aimed at investigating the effect of Human Resource Management outsourcing, BPR outsourcing and Information Communication Technology outsourcing on performance of manufacturing businesses in South-East, Nigeria. Relevant literature on outsourcing strategies were reviewed under conceptual framework, theoretical framework, and empirical review. The research work was anchored on resource-based theory and transaction cost theory. Survey research design was adopted. The population of the study was 1473. The statistical formula devised by Borg and Gall (1973), was employed to arrive at a sample size of 282. The population used in the analysis was 237. Pearson product moment correlation coefficient and was used in testing the hypotheses and T-test for test of significance was adopted to equally estimate for the significance of the coefficient and to ascertain whether the claim of the null or alternative hypothesis would still remain valid after the test. The result of the hypotheses shows that Human Resource Management outsourcing has a significant positive effect on competitive advantage of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria. Business Manufacturing Process outsourcing has a significant positive effect on organizational profitability of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria. Information Management outsourcing has a significant positive effect on cost effectiveness of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria. Internal audit outsourcing has a significant positive effect on operational effectiveness of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria. The study concluded that outsourcing has a significant positive effect on competitive advantage of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria. The study recommended that Management should choose outsourced Human Resource Management carefully, pick a quality Human Resource Management service provider and transition tasks to them gradually, closely monitor and manage the collaboration by establishing precise specifications and watching closely the service providers' activity.

Keywords: Human Resource Management outsourcing, Business manufacturing process outsourcing and Information Communication Technology outsourcing

INTRODUCTION

Over the past couple of decades, manufacturing firms in Nigeria have dived into outsourcing to meet demand and compete in the global market which has been shown to play a dire role in achieving competitiveness among companies all over the world. Manufacturing firms need number of skills to commence and complete various tasks with the allocated time, rational cost, quantity and quality standard performance which can only be viable if organizations take up those core activities they can do better while the remaining parts of the tasks are handed over to those vendors to ensure best quality product or service (Javed & Muhammad, 2020). The occurrence of technological innovation, complex business processes, knowledge advancement and need for constant growth has made organization look critically into the capabilities of its workers and develop suitable strategies to enhance performance by

focusing on core competences in order to reduce cost savings, reduced capital investment within the firm, improved responsiveness to changes in the business environment, increased competition among suppliers ensuring higher quality goods and services in the future, reduced risk of changing technology, among others (Agburu, Anza & Iyortsuun, 2017). Outsourcing is not a new phenomenon in the global world. This can be dated back to previous researchers who found out that the early stage of outsourcing, computer service companies were mainly used to run programs within the areas of financial and operational support such as the electronic data systems handled the data processing services for other businesses as early as 1963 (Masinga & Kiarie, 2014).

Manufacturing firms in Nigeria have been facing different challenges in information technology management, manufacturing process, human resource management, technology, research, internal auditing, accounting services etc. Globalization has led many manufacturing firms to outsource their non-core activities to service providers because of the diverse nature of business process and focus on their core competence to maintain quality management which has been a big problem for manufacturing firms (Orogbu, Onyeizugbe & Alanza, 2015). Most organizations in the world use external service providers who are specialist in order to offer cost effectiveness and efficiency in order to survive in a competitive market as outsourcing is no longer viewed as a cost reduction approach but an effective business management strategy aimed at increasing customer satisfaction and ensuring continued relevance in a competitive global market (Cox 2014 as cited in Jacqueline, 2019). But notwithstanding, outsourcing is also fraught with various problems. Outsourcing reduces a company's control over how certain services are delivered which in turn may raise the company's liability, overdependence on suppliers, costs rise, lack of supplier flexibility, lack of managerial skills to control suppliers and unrealistic expectations of outsourcing providers due to over promising at negotiations stage (Yanit, 2020).

Several researches have been conducted over the decade as it relates to outsourcing strategies and organizational performance. Despite these numbers of studies, little empirical studies exist on outsourcing strategies in manufacturing firms on developing countries especially in Nigeria (Nkasirim & Onuoha, 2018). Despite scholarly contributions to the subject under discussion, there is still a shortage of literature on this concept especially in the area of information technology management, business manufacturing process, and human resource management. On this premise, this study examines the link between outsourcing strategy and organizational performance of manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

Statement of the Problem

Globalization has made businesses to be faced with increased competition as a result of new technologies, internet services, and this new trend has turned to outsourcing not only to reduce their operating costs but also to transform business models to compete more effectively (Mohamed, Mohamed, Aiman & Ahmed, 2018). The Nigerian dynamic business environment has made manufacturing firms to adopt outsourcing strategies to meet competitive global market. Manufacturing industry is seen as one of the leading business activities in Nigeria with the likes of Dangote cement, Bua cement, Innoson manufacturing companies just to mention but a few and has employed numerous family households which indirectly has curb poverty to a certain extent. Efforts to boost growth in manufacturing industry have been undertaken with outsourcing being one of the strategies (Kamanga & Ismail, 2016). Outsourcing is a very crucial function in an organisation because it directly affects the firm's operational activities.

Past studies have examined the impact of outsourcing and identified several main benefits of outsourcing which includes cost reduced internal capital investment, better readiness to respond to turbulence in the business environment and improved service delivery (Lawson, Tyler & Potter, 2014 as cited in Musau, 2016). But as the competition is heating up, manufacturing firms that solely depend on its expertise are faced with poor information technology management, poor human resource planning, poor internal auditing, and poor accounting services and so on. This has led to cost overrun, compromising on quality and undue delays ultimately lead to dissatisfied performance which causes delays and leads to dissatisfaction of customers (Javed & Muhammad, 2020). Although, effective strategies have been developed to curb shortcomings of the outsourcing strategies in the Nigerian

business environment. Manufacturing firms in recent times are still faced with all these challenges. It is against this backdrop that the study examined outsourcing strategies and organizational performance of manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

Objectives of the Study

The overall objective of this research is to investigate outsourcing strategies and organizational performance of manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria. In order to achieve this, the research attempted to achieve the following objectives:

1. Determine the extent of human resource management outsourcing and competitive advantage of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.
2. Evaluate the effect of business manufacturing process outsourcing and organizational profitability of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.
3. To investigate the degree of information technology management outsourcing for cost effectiveness of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

Research Questions

The following research questions were formulated to achieve the objectives of the study:

1. To what extent does human resource management outsourcing influence competitive advantage of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria?
2. To what degree does business manufacturing process outsourcing affect organizational profitability of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria?
3. To what degree does information technology management outsourcing influence cost effectiveness of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria?

Hypotheses

The following null hypotheses were formulated to guide this study:

- Ho:** Human Resource Management outsourcing has no significant positive effect on competitive advantage of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.
- Ho:** Business Manufacturing Process outsourcing has no significant positive effect on organizational profitability of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.
- Ho:** Information technology outsourcing has no significant positive effect on cost effectiveness of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

Conceptual Review

Outsourcing

Several researchers have provided comprehensive definitions of the term ‘Outsourcing. Outsourcing is an abbreviation for “outside resource using” and has been defined as a decision by firms to have an external supplier to take over an activity that would have otherwise been performed in-house by organization employees. (Arnold, 2000; Eyaa 2006 as cited in Nzewi & Dadzie, 2015). Outsourcing is a management strategy by which an organization delegates major, non-core functions to specialized and efficient service providers. Yankelovich (2003) in Akewushola & Elegbede (2022) indicated that two-third of companies world-wide outsource at least one business process to an external third party and this practice appears to be most common in the U.S., Canada, and Australia, where 72 percent of outsourcing is being sought. Competition in the global market has enhanced technological changes which firms have adopted either tactical or strategic outsourcing, by looking for ways of reducing costs and building new opportunities by optimizing the use of internal and external resources attains its strategic goals on core activities leading to superior performance (Kamanga & Ismail, 2016). Outsourcing has reduced costs, brought about the growth of the companies, also eliminated waste and has enabled companies to focus on key functions. (Mutual, 2012).

Outsourcing can be defined as the process which a company contract non-core process with another company to provide services that might otherwise be performed by within employees (Sako, 2016). Dibbern, Goles, Hirschheim, & Jayatilaka (2004) in Egole & Iheriohanma (2020) defined outsourcing is

an arrangement by which one firm provides services to another firm that could be done within or is the transfer of some operations / functions to external service providers that, such authority is delegated to another party for the provision of services under a business contract that incorporates service level agreements related to cost, quality and timely delivery of product and service. Outsourcing enables firms to tap into new ideas, knowledge and creativity through access to service providers' resources like skills, experience, specialized equipment and investments to provide services of better quality, at lower costs than in-house departments (Yang, et al., 2017 in Okoye, 2021).

Kayumba (2019) also defined outsourcing known as a good technique for management can be defined as the strategy of using outside resources to implement activities traditionally managed by internal staff. To implement effective outsourcing requires a precise understanding and assessment of organizational current and future capabilities and will be based on the principle of cost reduction, time maximization, and quality assurance. In recent times, scholars' contribution in terms of cost, quality, and technology adoption has been examined by Felix and Shale (2016) in the manufacturing sector in Kenya which had a positive impact on organizational performance (Nkasirim & Onuoha, 2018). Similarly, Hafiz (2019) examined the impact of cost-driven strategic outsourcing on the organizational performance of manufacturing companies in Nigeria. The study found out that cost-driven strategic outsourcing has a significant effect on organizational performance of manufacturing companies in Nigeria.

Human Resource Management Outsourcing: Human resources are a solitary biggest info which decides the degree of proficiency of the organizations. Any association cannot arrange the business thoughts, produce and market an item without the help of human resources (Patil, 2020). The extent to which an organization is able to realize its goals depends, largely, on its ability to attract, develop, maintain, and retain the right quality and quantity of human resource (HR) capital. The human resource function has the responsibility of ensuring that the required quality and number of employees are available when and where they are needed in the organization (Igbinomwanhia, Iyayi & Iyayi, 2013). Today's human resource (HR) managers are expected to shed some of their conventional roles associated with policies and procedures and the hiring, selecting, training and compensating of workforce, for more strategic roles that include customers' perception of quality, reducing overall costs of human resource administration and management of scarce resources (Olannye & Okoro, 2017).

Business Manufacturing Process Outsourcing: Business process outsourcing generally refers to outsourcing and it applies to contract made between two organisations whereby one organization will manage some or all processes of the other organization (Sharma, 2004 in Kung'u, 2016). This involves the Strategy used in handing over the operations and responsibilities of an organisation's business process to a specialised vendor in order to improve the quality of business processes, reduce operational costs, improve operational efficiency and effectiveness, access superior resources and capabilities from vendors, and save time for management to concentrate on their core business in order to meet organisational as well as stakeholder expectations (Gituma, 2019).

Information Technology Management Outsourcing: Over the past few years, information technology management outsourcing has become very popular. Information technology management can be seen as various technological tools/devices and application/system used to create, transmit, circulate, store, and manage information such as computers, telephones, faxes, radio calls, Television, radios, network devices like routers, internet, switches, internet cables, servers, CCTV; applications/systems are Offender Management Information System, payroll system, Criminal Record system, Whatsapp, Facebook, websites, and web mails (Atugonza, 2018). Outsourcing information technology can reduce its overall cost to the firm; this was the focus of our study. Prior information technology outsourcing studies have examined a wide variety of topics, including why firms choose to outsource, management and relationship issues associated with it, and the performance outcomes associated with it.

Organizational Performance

Precarious problems facing modern business is to determine what causes failure and success in their endeavors' in the global market. It has become crucial for managers to know which factors affect their organizations performance in order for them to take appropriate steps to initiate them (Mohamed,

Mohamed, Aiman & Ahmed, 2018). Performance is the evaluation of the constituents that try to assess the capability and ability of a company in achieving the constituents' aspiration levels using efficiency, effectiveness, or social referent criteria (Thompson, 1967; Friedlander et al., 1968; in Jacqueline, 2019). Organization performance can be termed as; production output, profitability, sales turnover, market share, and many other accounting ratios. According to Richard et al, (2009) in Mwangi (2017), organizational performance comprises three specific areas of firm outcomes: (a) financial performance, (b) product or service market, and (c) shareholder return. Organizational performance is defined as 'the results of operations of an organization during a given timeframe (Cousins et al., 2006 in Javed, Rafique & Tufail, 2020). Organization performance is the extent to which the organization achieves a set of pre-determined targets such as: customer value, team performance, talent management, and strategic focus all which are achieved through, proper planning, evaluation, implementation and control which can be accomplished if management has access to right knowledge and skills, proper planning, innovation and flexibility (Kamanga & Ismail, 2016). Organization performance measures consists of return on equity, profit, return on assets, market share while non-financial performance measures consists of corporate social responsibility, innovation, responsiveness and employee development (Kamanga & Ismail, 2016).

Theoretical Framework

The theoretical foundation of this study is anchored on two theories; Resource-Based Theory. The Resource-Based View theory was propounded by Wernerfelt, (1984). This theory is also called core-competence theory. The theory holds that a firm has the ability to achieve and sustain competitive advantage if it possesses resources that are valuable, rare, imperfectly imitable and non-substitutable and the goal of an organization is to ensure it has access to and control of valuable resources by developing and securing all the relevant resources either internally or externally. The argument here fits with the need and factors that lead to outsourcing decisions in firms, whether they are cost reduction, new product/services introduction, focus on core competencies or labour flexibility and how they improve organizational performance (Masinga & Kiarie, 2014). This theory argues that the core competence of the firms must sustain competitive advantage by having valuable firm resources are usually scarce, imperfectly imitable, and lacking in direct substitutes; It is about producing the most value from one's existing capabilities and resources by combining these with others' sources of advantage and, in this, ensuring complementarities is paramount (Agburu, Nyianshima, Anza & Akuraun, 2017).

Resource based theory emphasized on the firm's internal resource rather than external opportunities that in order to generate sustainable competitive advantage a resource must provide economic value and must be presently scarce, difficult to imitate, non-substitutable and not readily obtainable from markets and relies on two key points; first that resource are determinants of firm performance and second that resources must be rare, valuable, difficult to imitate and non-substitutable by other rare resources. When the latter occurs a competitive advantage has been created (Priem & Butler, 2001 in Kmanaga & Ismail, 2016). The relationship of this theory to this study is that for manufacturing firms to gain sustained competitive advantage, they must have access to strategic resources which are rare, valuable and cannot be duplicated. This simply implies that manufacturing firms can gain competitive advantage over its competitors if it has access to advanced technology, manufacturing process, IT management which must be rare and valuable which cannot be easily duplicated.

The second theory anchored on this work is the transaction cost theory. The transaction cost theory was propounded by Harland, Knight, Lamming & Walker (2005) and they posited that costs is related to the effort, time, and costs associated with searching, creating, negotiating, monitoring, and enforcing a service contract between buyers and suppliers and production cost is the cost incurred to make the product or to provide the service. If these costs are outweighed by the savings from specialization which outsourcing offers, then a firm will decide to outsource (Nzewi & Dadzie, 2015). Transaction costs is based on a rational decision made by firms after considering transaction related factors such as

asset specificity, environmental uncertainty and other types of transaction cost and consist of five major components: searching cost, negotiating cost, contracting cost, monitoring cost and enforcement cost and it was found that companies that follow the basic transaction cost hypothesis, i.e. having high costs of finding and negotiating with partners, tend to use a greater degree of control (Kakabadse and Kakabadse, 2000 in Rehema & Rugami, 2018). Transaction costs include time, money, human resources, contract issues negotiation matters, risks e.tc (Kmanaga & Ismail, 2016).

The relationship of transaction cost to this work is that manufacturing firms should be more concerned with the minimization of costs in transactions and production by buying goods and services if only the transaction cost is low. But when the transaction costs are high, the company is better off producing the goods.

Empirical Review

Javed, Rafique and Muhammad (2020) analyzed the perceived impact of outsourcing services including construction works like Electrical, Heating/Ventilating/Air-conditioning, Transportation and Civil on organizational performance in construction industry at Karachi. This research work employed deductive approach. The data was collected through questionnaire from a sample of 155 employees of the construction industry which 150 questionnaires were completed in all respects. Likert scale ranging from 1 to 5 was analysed through statistical tools correlation and regression analysis by using SPSS, version 23. The findings revealed a significant relationship between outsourcing services and organizational performance in the construction industry. As per findings of this study, the impact of outsourcing of Heating/Ventilating/Air-conditioning services is not significant on organizational performance, whereas other outsourced services like Electrical, Transportation and Civil works have significant positive impact on organizational performance. The study recommended that organizations and vendors regarding outsourced activities should be enhanced to ensure long term strategic partnership.

Rehema & Rugami (2018) investigated the effects of outsourcing on organization performance among commercial banks in Mombasa County. The specific objectives of this study were to determine the influence of outsourcing risks, outsourcing costs, quality of service and functional department on the performance of commercial banks in Mombasa County, Transaction cost theory and resource-based view theory was in this study. This study used descriptive research design. The target population for this study was strategy managers in all commercial banks in Mombasa County. The study sample was 90 strategy managers who were selected through census survey. The study made use of questionnaires to collect data. Descriptive statistics such as (mean and standard deviation) were used to analyse quantitative data. The research found out that outsourcing risks, outsourcing costs, quality of service and functional departments had a positive and significant effect on the performance of Commercial Banks in Mombasa County, Kenya. The study concludes that Risks in outsourcing may arise due to possibility of weak management, inexperienced staff, business uncertainty, outdated technology skills, environmental uncertainty, hidden costs, and lack of organizational learning and loss of innovative capacity. The study recommends that commercial banks when drafting a contract should make sure to include all the expected services, and read carefully for any surcharges or extra charges.

Yanit (2020) examined the effects of outsourcing on organizational performance at CBE. Explanatory research design and purposive sampling to select a sample form. The population was 200 branch managers from six major departments. Data was collected from primary sources through survey method by use of questionnaires. Descriptive statistics and inferential analysis by use of statistical package for social sciences (SPSS) version 20 software was used. Both correlation and regression analysis in testing the hypotheses. The findings shows that costs and the performance of the bank is having an insignificant strong positive relationship as implied by ($r=0.137$, $p>0.134$). Focus and the performance of the bank is satisfactory have a significant moderate positive relationship as shown by correlation coefficient of ($r=0.278$, $p<0.002$). There is a significant positive relationship between quality and the performance of the bank is satisfactory ($r=0.375$, $p<0.000$). According to the regression analysis, quality driven

outsourcing has a significant impact on performance ($\beta = .263$, $t = 3.557$, $p < 0.05$). However, since significant value $p > .05$ cost driven and focus driven outsourcing do not significantly predict performance. It was recommended CBE should outsource with a clear picture in mind as to why they want to outsource.

Jacqueline (2019) assessed the effect of employees outsourcing to the organization performance at ZANTEL (Zanzibar Telecom Limited) Headquarter. The specific objectives were to determine the relationship between employee outsourcing and organization performance, to examine the contribution of employee outsourcing towards organization performance and to determine the challenges of outsourced employees in an organization. Case study research design was used to analyze the research questions. Descriptive analysis and correlation analysis technique were used. A sample size of 80 respondents was generated. Structured questionnaires and interview was the main source of data collection. The study found out that there is a strong relationship between employees outsourcing and organization performance. It concluded that the direction relationship among the identified variables (profitability, productivity, sales growth, return on investment and brand image are positive correlated). It is recommended that the Human Resources Outsourcing effects are considered in necessary basis since they contribute to organization performance.

Opuene & Orusa (2020) examined the relationship between Business Process Outsourcing and Organizational Performance in Deposit Money Banks in Port Harcourt, Rivers State. The study adopted the cross-sectional survey in its investigation of the variables. Primary source of data was generated through self-administered questionnaire. The population of the study was 85 of nineteen (19) selected banks in Port Harcourt, Rivers State. The sample size of 85 was generated. The reliability of the instrument was achieved by the use of the Cronbach Alpha coefficient with all the items scoring above 0.70. Data generated were analyzed and presented using both descriptive and inferential statistical techniques. Spearman's Rank Order Correlation Statistics was used in testing the hypotheses. The study found out that Outsourcing positively and significantly influences Organizational performance in Deposit Money Banks in Port Harcourt, Rivers state, Nigeria. It concluded money deposit banks like any other business are keen in maintaining their performance level through profitability, improved customer service and growth. The study recommended that it is necessary for management of money deposit banks in Port Harcourt to use outsourcing technique because these techniques have the capacity to significantly improve the organizational performance.

Rehema & Rugami (2018) investigated the effects of outsourcing on organization performance among commercial banks in Mombasa County. The specific objectives of this study were to determine the influence of outsourcing risks, outsourcing costs, quality of service and functional department on the performance of commercial banks in Mombasa County, Transaction cost theory and resource-based view theory will be used in this study. This study used descriptive research design. The study sample was 90 strategy managers who were selected through census survey. The study made use of questionnaires to collect data. Descriptive statistics such as (mean and standard deviation) were used to analyse quantitative data. The study found out that outsourcing risks, outsourcing costs, quality of service and functional departments had a positive and significant effect on the performance of Commercial Banks in Mombasa County, Kenya. The study concluded that risks in outsourcing may arise due to possibility of weak management, inexperienced staff, business uncertainty, outdated technology skills, environmental uncertainty, hidden costs, and lack of organizational learning and loss of innovative capacity. The study recommends that commercial banks when drafting a contract should make sure to include all the expected services, and read carefully for any surcharges or extra charges.

Andow, Dabo & Ejeh (2018) examines the impact of outsourcing on organizational performance of listed food and beverage firms in Nigeria. The objectives of the study were to examine the impact of Business Process Outsourcing on organizational performance and determine whether Knowledge Process Outsourcing has any impact on organizational performance. The study uses a correlation design, and used secondary data as the main instrument of data collection. The population and sample of the study includes all the eighteen (18) food and beverages firms listed on the floor of the Nigeria stock exchange

between 2007-2016. Ordinary Least square (OLS) regression analysis using statistical package for social science (SPSS) was employed to analyze the data and test the hypotheses. The findings reveal that both business process outsourcing and knowledge process outsourcing have a positive and significant impact on organizational performance of listed food and beverage firms in Nigeria. The study concludes that business process outsourcing and knowledge process outsourcing have significantly impacted on the organizational performance which is profitability and competitive advantage of the listed food and beverage firms in Nigeria. The study recommends that the management of these firms should engage in outsourcing strategy in decision making by outsourcing its business processes and knowledge processes in order to increase their profit and achieve performance.

Egbule & Egberi (2021) analysed the impact of outsourcing strategies on organizational effectiveness in banks in Asaba town. The objectives of the study were to determine the impact of recruitment outsourcing strategy on organizational effectiveness, ascertain the effect of outsourced training and development strategy on organizational effectiveness and identify the impact of mystery shopping outsourcing strategy on organizational effectiveness. Survey design was adopted, and the statistical tool employed comprises frequency, correlation as well as regression analysis. The findings show that there is a significant positive relationship between the variables of outsourcing strategies and organizational effectiveness. It concluded that mystery shopping provides important information for businesses and increases organizational effectiveness. The study thus recommends that banks should outsource their training & development activities, since its potential effect is cost reduction, as outsourced training provides a means of reducing the fixed costs associated with maintaining a training staff.

Kivuva (2018) analyzed the effects of outsourcing services in the oil marketing firms in Kenya. The objectives of the study were to find out the effects of Professional services, manufacturing outsourcing, Process specific outsourcing services on organizational performance and operational outsourcing services on organizational performance. Descriptive research design was employed in this study. The population of the study consisted of 30 oil companies in Kenya with a target population of 120 managers. The study used primary sources to collect data by use of questionnaires. Data analysis was done using Microsoft Excel and statistical packages for social sciences (SPSS). The study findings were that outsourcing influences organization performance even though to a small extent. It concluded that HR outsourcing, logistics outsourcing, and customer care outsourcing companies will get a competitive advantage as they get the best services from the professional as well as make good margins of profit. The study recommended that Company should adopt process specific outsourcing in their plans as a way of improving profitability.

Nkasirim & Onuoha (2018) examined the relationship between outsourcing strategies and organizational effectiveness of oil companies in Rivers state. The objectives of the study were to determine the nexus between expertise orientation and organizational culture on organizational productivity and to examine the nexus between expertise orientation and organizational culture and corporate growth. The study employed a cross-sectional research survey. The population of the study was ten (10) selected oil companies. A total of 998 staffs were surveyed. Simple random sampling technique was employed with a sample size of 286. A questionnaire was used to collect data from the respondents. Spearman Rank Order Correlation Coefficient was used to test the hypotheses with the aid of Statistical Package for Social Science (SPSS) version 20.0. It was found that outsourcing strategies have a significant positive relationship with the organizational effectiveness of oil companies in Rivers State. The study concluded that outsourcing strategies that are based on expertise orientation and corporate culture would improve the organizational efficiency of oil companies. One of the recommendations is that managers should effectively implement outsourcing strategies, to enhance organizational effectiveness.

Okoye (2021) examined the effect of outsourcing strategies on organizational performance of fast food industries in Anambra, State Nigeria. The specific objectives were to determine if product/service quality and employee competence have an effect on organizational performance. The study adopted the quantitative research design. Structured questionnaire with 5 Likert rating scale was used in eliciting information. The total population was 1200 staff which was selected from 10 fast food industries in

Anambra State, Nigeria. A sample size of 300 was generated using Yaro's formula. Frequency distribution table, Likert scale and simple percentage in analyzing the data collected while the hypotheses were tested using analysis of variance (ANOVA), correlation efficient and regression analysis. The result from the findings revealed that that outsourcing for product/service quality has significant effect on organizational performance of selected fast foods industry in Anambra, State, Nigeria. The Study that outsourcing strategies have a positive significant effect on organizational performance of selected fast foods industry in Anambra, State Nigeria. It concluded that businesses all over the world go as far as possible to acquire equipment and products that they perceive would aid their business transactions and performance. The study recommends that employee competence, fast food industries should offer better terms of service and proper training to help improve employee competence and reduce costs of outsourcing its human resources functions for better performance.

Kayumba (2019) investigated the effect of outsourcing on the organizational performance (cost efficiency, productivity and profitability) in Rwanda. The specific objectives of this study was to identify activities or services outsourced by organizations in Rwanda, to find out the main reasons of outsourcing for organizations in Rwanda; to assess the level of their performance as a result of outsourcing strategy and finally, to establish the relationship between outsourcing activities and organizational performance. Three sample companies have been selected from Telecom and manufacturing Industry of Rwanda with a sample size of 111 staff selected by using convenient and purposive sampling. Primary and secondary source of data were used in gathering and eliciting information from the respondents. The hypotheses of the study was tested using correlation analysis. The findings of this research have shown that outsourcing activities contributed to the organizational performance as revealed by respondents regarding their views on effect of outsourcing on cost efficiency, productivity and profitability. It concluded that organizations should never allow external service provider to perform all the responsibility because this can lead to the loss of control over certain production or operation activities. This study therefore recommended that organizations in Rwanda should continue to improve how they manage their outsourcing activities by emphasizing on non-core activities instead of outsourcing their core activities.

Egole & Iheriohanma (2020) examined outsourcing as a strategy and its effect on organizational performance using Nigeria Bottling Company Plant and Camela Vegetable Oil Company both situated in Owerri, Imo State. The objectives were to determine if back office activities, primary activities, support activities and accounting activities have an effect on organisational performance. The survey research design was adopted in the study. Primary and secondary data was used in collecting information. The research hypotheses was tested using chi-square. The study found out that outsourcing back office, primary and support activities have significant positive effect on organizational performance. The study concluded that outsourcing as a strategy for improved performance in organizations. It recommended that indigenous and multinational organizations in Nigeria should implement outsourcing strategies such as as the back office, primary and supporting outsourcing activities have been shown to be of positive effect on organizational performance.

Thanh, Nghiem, gam & Nhung (2022) studied the impact of labour outsourcing on the financial performance of small and medium enterprises in Mekong Delta, Vietnam. The main objective was to determine if outsourced resources positively affect financial performance. The study collected data from administrators at 409 Small and medium Enterprises (SMEs). Analytical methods such as cronbach's Alpha test, Explonatory factor analysis (EFA), confirmatory factor analysis (CFA) were used in the study. The study found out that labour outsourcing positively affects financial performance. It concluded that outsourcing depends on the functional characteristics of enterprise, risk control, manager's attitude, and relationships in outsourcing. It recommended that managers should increase outsourcing to improve SMEs performance.

METHODOLOGY

Survey research design was adopted. This study was conducted in South-East, Nigeria. South-East, Nigeria consists of five states; Anambra, Enugu, Abia, Imo, and Ebonyi. With respect to this research,

the researcher made use of primary and secondary sources of data. The primary source of data is the questionnaire, while the secondary sources of data include the journals, magazines, textbooks, and internet. The population of the study comprised 1473. The sample consists 282 using Borg and Gall (1973) formula. The research instrument used for the study was the questionnaire. The questionnaire was subjected to content and face validity. Test-retest method and spearman rank order correlation coefficient was used to obtained the the reliability of instrument. Simple percentages and Pearson product moment correlation use to answer the research question and testing hypotheses.

DATA PRESENTATION, ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION

This chapter deals with the presentation and analysis of data collected from the population under study through questionnaires and interview. 282 copies of the same questionnaire were distributed, out of which 241 copies were returned and out the returned copies, 2 copies were not properly filled, while 4 copies were not returned. So the percentages of returned copies is 85%, unreturned copies 1%, spoilt copies 1% and the questionnaire used for the analysis was 83%. The analysis is based on frequency distribution and simple percentages.

Analysis of Survey Question

Research Question 1: *How does human resource outsourcing affects organizational competitive advantage of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria?*

Table 1: Responses on human resource outsourcing and organizational competitive advantage of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

	SCALE					TOTAL
	SA,	A,	U,	D,	SD	
Human resources are a solitary biggest info which decides the degree of proficiency of the organizations.	104 (44)	96 (41)	12 (5)	18 (7)	7 (3)	237 (100)
The extent to which an organization is able to realize its goals depends, largely, on its ability to attract, develop, maintain, and retain the right quality and quantity of human resource (HR) capital.	102 (43)	78 (33)	10 (4)	26 (11)	21 (9)	237 (100)
Any association can't arrange the business thoughts, produce and market an item without the help of human resources	109 (46)	90 (38)	4 (2)	14 (6)	20 (8)	237 (100)
HR outsourcing ensures that the required quality and number of employees are available when and where they are needed in the organization	106 (45)	87 (37)	15 (6)	17 (7)	12 (5)	237 (100)
It helps in reducing overall costs of human resource administration and management of scarce resources	102 (43)	88 (37)	9 (4)	25 (11)	13 (5)	237 (100)
Total	105 (44.2)	88 (37.2)	10 (4.2)	20 (8.4)	14 (6)	237 (100)

Note: The figures in Parenthesis are Percentages

Source field: Survey, 2023

The table above shows the opinion of respondents on human resource outsourcing and organizational competitive advantage of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria. As could be seen from the table, five test questions were posed. The first test question was to determine if human resources are a solitary biggest info which decides the degree of proficiency of the organizations. From the responses, 44% strongly agreed, 41% agreed, 5% remained undecided, 7% disagreed and 3% strongly disagreed.

The second test question was to determine if the extent to which an organization is able to realize its goals depends, largely, on its ability to attract, develop, maintain, and retain the right quality and quantity of

human resource capital. From the responses, 43% strongly agreed, 33% agreed, 4% remained undecided, 11% disagreed and 9% strongly disagreed.

The third test question was posed to determine any association can't arrange the business thoughts, produce and market an item without the help of human resources. From the responses, 46% strongly agreed, 38% agreed, 2% remained undecided, 6% disagreed and 8% strongly disagreed.

The fourth test question was posed to determine if HR outsourcing ensures that the required quality and number of employees are available when and where they are needed in the organization. From the responses, 45% strongly agreed, 37% agreed, 6% remained undecided, 7% disagreed and 5% strongly disagreed. The fifth test question sought out to determine if it helps in reducing overall costs of human resource administration and management of scarce resources. From the responses, 43% strongly agreed, 37% agreed, 4% remained undecided, 11% disagreed and 5% strongly disagreed. The table shows that 44.2% of the respondents on the average strongly agreed with the Statement of the items, 37.2% agreed, 4.2 were undecided, 8.4% disagreed and 6% strongly disagreed. Highlight of the Statement of the items shows that human resource outsourcing affects organizational competitive advantage of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

Research Question Two: *To what extent has business manufacturing process outsourcing affect organizational profitability of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria?*

Table 2: Responses on business manufacturing process affect organizational profitability of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

	SCALE					TOTAL
	SA,	A,	U,	D,	SD	
It improves the quality of business processes	109 (46)	81 (34)	8 (3)	21 (9)	18 (8)	237 (100)
It reduce operational costs, improve operational efficiency and effectiveness	108 (46)	100 (42)	9 (4)	16 (7)	4 (2)	237 (100)
It saves time for management to concentrate on their core business in order to meet organisational as well as stakeholder expectations	105 (44)	97 (41)	7 (3)	19 (8)	9 (4)	237 (100)
It encourages team innovation with the mediating effects of knowledge sharing and team communication	129 (55)	81 (34)	9 (4)	10 (4)	8 (3)	237 (100)
It encourages access to superior resources and capabilities from vendors	119 (50)	83 (35)	5 (2)	28 (12)	2 (1)	237 (100)
Total	114 (48)	88 (37)	8 (3)	19 (8)	8 (4)	237 (100)

Note: The figures in Parenthesis are Percentages

Source field: Survey, 2023

The table above shows the opinion of respondents on how business manufacturing process affect organizational profitability of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria. As could be seen from the table, five test questions were posed. The first test question was to determine if it improves the quality of business processes. From the responses, 46% strongly agreed, 34% agreed, 3% remained undecided, 9% disagreed and 8% strongly disagreed.

The second test question was to determine if it reduce operational costs, improve operational efficiency and effectiveness. From the responses, 46% strongly agreed, 42% agreed, 4% remained undecided, 7% disagreed and 2% strongly disagreed.

The third test question was posed to determine it saves time for management to concentrate on their core business in order to meet organizational as well as stakeholder expectations. From the responses, 44% strongly agreed, 41% agreed, 3% remained undecided, 8% disagreed and 4% strongly disagreed.

The fourth test question was posed to determine if it encourages team innovation with the mediating effects of knowledge sharing and team communication. From the responses, 55% strongly agreed, 34% agreed, 4% remained undecided, 4% disagreed and 3% strongly disagreed.

The fifth test question sought out to determine if it encourages access to superior resources and capabilities from vendors. From the responses, 50% strongly agreed, 35% agreed, 2% remained undecided, 12% disagreed and 1% strongly disagreed.

The table shows that 48% of the respondents on the average strongly agreed with the Statement of the items, 37% agreed, 3% were undecided, 8% disagreed and 4% strongly disagreed. Highlight of the statement of the items shows that business manufacturing process affect organizational profitability of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

Research Question Three: *How does information technology management outsourcing affect cost effectiveness of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria?*

Table 3 Responses on information technology management and cost effectiveness of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

	SCALE					TOTAL
	SA,	A,	U,	D,	SD	
Outsourcing IT can reduce its overall cost to the firm.	131 (55)	73 (31)	4 (2)	23 (10)	6 (2)	237 (100)
Organizations access more advanced technologies and count on more motivated staff and better management systems in order to be able to achieve a better service coordination or control	116 (49)	82 (35)	9 (4)	20 (8)	10 (4)	237 (100)
Organizations can have access to specialized, state-of-the-art technology which is supposedly supplied to them by the provider.	110 (46)	66 (28)	12 (5)	21 (9)	28 (12)	237 (100)
It increases productivity and competitiveness through efficient integration of innovative systems that have been tailor made to meet the needs of today's businesses	112 (47)	80 (34)	10 (4)	19 (8)	16 (7)	237 (100)
A large degree of flexibility in the utilization of IT resources and makes it easier to face business level volatility	111 (47)	86 (36)	13 (6)	15 (6)	12 (5)	237 (100)
Total	116 (49)	77 (33)	10 (4)	20 (8)	14 (6)	237 (100)

Note: The figures in Parenthesis are Percentages

Source field: Survey, 2023

The table above shows the opinion of respondents on how information technology management affect cost effectiveness of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria. As could be seen from the table, five test questions were posed. The first test question was to determine if outsourcing information technology (IT) can reduce its overall cost to the firm. From the responses, 55% strongly agreed, 31% agreed, 2% remained undecided, 10% disagreed and 2% strongly disagreed.

The second test question was to determine if organizations access more advanced technologies and count on more motivated staff and better management systems in order to be able to achieve a better service coordination or control. From the responses, 49% strongly agreed, 35% agreed, 4% remained undecided, 8% disagreed and 4% strongly disagreed.

The third test question was posed to determine the Organizations can have access to specialized, state-of-the-art technology which is supposedly supplied to them by the provider. From the responses, 46% strongly agreed, 28% agreed, 5% remained undecided, 9% disagreed and 12% strongly disagreed.

The fourth test question was posed to determine it increases productivity and competitiveness through efficient integration of innovative systems that have been tailor made to meet the needs of today's businesses. From the responses, 47% strongly agreed, 34% agreed, 4% remained undecided, 8% disagreed and 7% strongly disagreed.

The fifth test question sought out to determine if a large degree of flexibility in the utilization of IT resources and makes it easier to face business level volatility. From the responses, 47% strongly agreed, 36% agreed, 6% remained undecided, 6% disagreed and 5% strongly disagreed.

The table shows that 49% of the respondents on the average strongly agreed with the Statement of the items, 33% agreed, 4% were undecided, 8% disagreed and 6% strongly disagreed. Highlight of the Statement of the items shows that information technology management affect cost effectiveness of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

Testing Of Hypotheses

Hypothesis One

Hypothesis one sought out to determine if human resource management outsourcing influences competitive advantage of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

Ho: Human Resource Management outsourcing has no significant positive effect on competitive advantage of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

Hi: Human Resource Management outsourcing has a significant positive effect on competitive advantage of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

To test the null hypothesis, relevant data that suggest opinions of the respondents on the issue of human resource management outsourcing influences competitive advantage of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

Table 4 Calculation of Correlation Coefficient for Hypothesis one

S/N	OPTIONS	X POINTS	Y RESPONSES	XY	X ²	Y ²
1	Strongly Agree	5	105	525	25	11025
2	Agree	4	88	352	16	7744
3	Undecided	3	10	30	9	100
4	Disagree	2	20	40	4	400
5	Strongly Disagree	1	14	14	1	196
	TOTAL	15	237	961	55	19465

SOURCE: FIELD SURVEY, 2023

Using the Pearson product moment correlation coefficient formula given as:

$$r = \frac{n\sum xy - \sum x \sum y}{\sqrt{[n\sum x^2 - (\sum x)^2][n\sum y^2 - (\sum y)^2]}}$$

From the data of table 4.1.2, we have

$$r = \frac{5(961) - (15)(237)}{\sqrt{[5(55) - (225)][5(19465) - (56169)]}}$$

$$\frac{1250}{1435}$$

R= 0.87

The correlation coefficient r= 0.87 as shown above is an indication that human resource management outsourcing has a significant positive effect on competitive advantage of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria. Nevertheless, there was a need to equally estimate for the significance of the coefficient and to ascertain whether the claim of the null hypothesis would still remain valid after the test. T-test for test of significance was adopted as follows:

$$T_{cal} = 0.87 \sqrt{\frac{5-2}{1-(0.87)^2}}$$

T_{cal} = 3.053

But $t_{0.05, 3} = 2.35$

Therefore the null hypothesis was rejected since $T_{cal} = 3.053 > T_{tab} = 2.35$, and the alternative which suggest that human resource management outsourcing has a significant positive effect on competitive advantage of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria will be accepted.

Hypothesis Two

Hypothesis two sought out to determine if business manufacturing process affect organizational profitability of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

Ho: Business Manufacturing Process outsourcing has no significant positive effect on organizational profitability of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

Hi: Business Manufacturing Process outsourcing has a significant positive effect on organizational profitability of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

To test the null hypothesis, relevant data that suggest opinions of the respondents on the issue of business manufacturing process affect organizational profitability of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

Table 5 Calculation of Correlation Coefficient for Hypothesis two

S/N	OPTIONS	X POINTS	Y RESPONSES	XY	X ²	Y ²
1	Strongly Agree	5	114	570	25	12996
2	Agree	4	88	352	16	7744
3	Undecided	3	8	24	9	64
4	Disagree	2	19	38	4	361
5	Strongly Disagree	1	8	8	1	64
TOTAL		15	237	992	55	21229

Source: Field Survey, 2023

Using the Pearson product moment correlation coefficient formula given as:

$$r = \frac{n\sum xy - \sum x \sum y}{\sqrt{[n\sum x^2 - (\sum x)^2][n\sum y^2 - (\sum y)^2]}}$$

$$r = \frac{5(992) - (15)(237)}{\sqrt{[5(55) - (225)][5(21229) - (56169)]}}$$

$$r = \frac{1405}{1581}$$

R= 0.89

The correlation coefficient $r = 0.89$ as shown above is an indication that business manufacturing process has a significant positive organizational profitability of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria. Nevertheless, there was a need to equally estimate for the significance of the coefficient and to ascertain whether the claim of the null hypothesis would still remain valid after the test. T-test for test of significance was adopted as follows:

$$T_{cal} = \sqrt{\frac{n-2}{1-(r)^2}}$$

Substituting the value of the correlation coefficient $r = 0.87$ in the above formula. We obtained the result:

$$T_{cal} = 0.89 \sqrt{\frac{5-2}{1-(0.89)^2}}$$

$T_{cal} = 3.36$

But $t_{0.05, 3} = 2.35$

Therefore the null hypothesis was rejected since $T_{cal} = 3.36 > T_{tab} = 2.35$, and the alternative which suggest that business manufacturing process has a significant positive organizational profitability of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

Hypothesis Three

Hypothesis three sought out to determine if information technology management outsourcing influence cost effectiveness of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

Ho: Information technology management outsourcing has no significant positive effect on cost effectiveness of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

Hi: Information technology Management outsourcing has a significant positive effect on cost effectiveness of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

To test the null hypothesis, relevant data that suggest opinions of the respondents on the issue of information technology management influences cost effectiveness of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

Table 6 Calculation of Correlation Coefficient for Hypothesis three

S/N	OPTIONS	X POINTS	Y RESPONSES	XY	X ²	Y ²
1	Strongly Agree	5	116	580	25	13456
2	Agree	4	77	308	16	5929
3	Undecided	3	10	30	9	100
4	Disagree	2	20	40	4	400
5	Strongly Disagree	1	14	14	1	196
	TOTAL	15	237	972	55	20081

Source: Field Survey, 2023

Using the Pearson product moment correlation coefficient formula given as:

$$r = \frac{n\sum xy - \sum x \sum y}{\sqrt{[n\sum x^2 - (\sum x)^2][n\sum y^2 - (\sum y)^2]}}$$

$$r = \frac{5(972) - (15)(237)}{\sqrt{[5(55) - (225)][5(20081) - (56169)]}}$$

$$r = \frac{1305}{1487}$$

r= 0.88

The correlation coefficient r= 0.88 as shown above is an indication that Information management outsourcing has a significant positive effect on cost effectiveness of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria. Nevertheless, there was a need to equally estimate for the significance of the coefficient and to ascertain whether the claim of the null hypothesis would still remain valid after the test. T-test for test of significance was adopted as follows:

$$T_{cal} = \frac{r}{\sqrt{\frac{1-r^2}{n-2}}}$$

Substituting the value of the correlation coefficient r= 0.87 in the above formula. We obtained the result:

$$T_{cal} = 0.88 \sqrt{\frac{5-2}{1-(0.88)^2}}$$

T_{cal}= 3.21

But t_{0.05, 3}= 2.35

Therefore the null hypothesis was rejected since T_{cal}= 3.21 > T_{tab}=2.35, and the alternative which suggest that Information technology management outsourcing has a significant positive effect on cost effectiveness of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

Summary of Findings

The major findings of the research work are as summarized below:

1. Human Resource Management outsourcing has a significant positive effect on competitive advantage of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.
2. Business Manufacturing Process outsourcing has a significant positive effect on organizational profitability of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

3. Information Technology Management outsourcing has a significant positive effect on cost effectiveness of selected manufacturing firms in South-East, Nigeria.

CONCLUSION

Outsourcing has become a strategic human resource tactic in our present good business atmosphere and is a crucial business strategy that must be employed by manufacturing firms in order to improve quality, reduce cost and enhance organisational growth as it assists organizations to leverage their skills and resources to achieve organizational growth. Outsourcing is a path to achieve more efficient, effective and competent functions in their processes and it is believed that firms who specialize in outsourcing tend to have improved performance, access to international markets and sophisticated technologies, can enhance responsiveness to customer needs, and contribute to organizational goals of increased productivity, efficiency, reduced costs, reduced cycle time, and improved quality of the goods and services in their organizations.

RECOMMENDATIONS

In view of the findings, the following recommendations were made;

1. Management should choose outsourced HR carefully, pick a quality HR service provider and transition tasks to them gradually, closely monitor and manage the collaboration by establishing precise specifications and watching closely the service providers' activity expert services as well as to take advantage of the excellent quality that external vendors provide and focus on their core competencies.
2. It is imperative for manufacturing companies to continuously create, update and acquire technological capabilities, identify production bottlenecks and improve training processes that would help generate a sustainable competitive advantage over their rivals.
3. Manufacturing companies should install and maintain newest hardware and software that will help enhance business processes, managerial decision making, workgroup collaboration, thus strengthening their competitive positions in rapidly changing and emerging economies.

REFERENCES

- Adeniji, Y. A. (2020). Internal audit outsourcing practices among micro, small and medium sized enterprises (MSMEs) in Lagos state. *European Journal of Business and Innovation Research* Vol.9, No.1, pp. 53-67, 2021.
- Alzhrani, A.M. (2020). Outsourcing human resource functions and their impact on organizational performance. *Global journal of management and business research: a administration and management volume 20 issue 4 version 1*.
- Andow, A.A., Dabo, Z. & Ejeh, E.C. (2018). Impact of outsourcing on organizational performance of listed food and beverages firms in Nigeria. *Lasu journal of employment relations & human resource management volume 1. No. 1, 2018*
- Akewushola, S. & Elegbede, E. (2022). Outsourcing strategy and organizational performance: empirical evidence from Nigeria manufacturing sector. *Research on humanities and social sciences* 10, (12), 12-22.
- Daproza, J. (2021). The impact of outsourcing accounting services to small and medium enterprises' growth and performance. *Global scientific journal: volume 9, issue 7, July 2021 issn 2320-9186*.
- Egbule A. C. S. & Egberi A. K. (2021). Outsourcing strategies for organizational effectiveness: a study of selected new generation banks in Asaba town. *International Journal of Management Technology*.7, (1), 20-30,
- Egole, I.S. & Iheriohanma, E.B.J (2020). Outsourcing and organizational performance: a comparative Analysis of Nigeria bottling company plant and Camela Vegetable oil Company, Owerri, Imo state, Nigeria. *Research on humanities and social science*.10, (12), 15-20.
- Eyinna, O. (2020). Internal audit functions outsourcing versus the independence of the external auditor: separation of staff of audit firm to the rescue? *International Journal of Accounting & Finance*.9, (1),10-20.
- Javed, A., Rafique, K.A. & Muhammad M.B.T. (2020). Perceived effect of outsourcing on organizational performance in Pakistani construction industry. *Advances in economics, business and management*

- research, volume 152 proceedings of the 5th Padang international conference on economics education, economics, business and management, accounting and entrepreneurship (piceeba-5 2020).
- Kayumba, U.C. (2019). Effect of outsourcing on organizational performance in Rwanda. Umeå School of business and economics master's program in finance master's thesis in business administration iii, 30 credits
- Kouame K.S. & Youngwoo L. (2019). The impact of outsourcing strategy on a firm's innovation and internationalization. *East Asian journal of business economics* 7(4), pp.1-13.
- Mohammed, D. & Adamu, R. (2020). Impact of accounting function outsourcing on SMES financial performance and efficiency: evidences from some selected manufacturing subsectors in Nigeria.
- Mulli, J. (2021). The effects of business process outsourcing practices on the operational performance of local Manufacturing Companies in Nairobi County Thesis, Strathmore University. Mohamed M. M., Mohamed A. R., Aiman A. R. & Ahmed M.E. (2018). The effect of outsourcing strategy on sme's performance: an empirical study of internet services providers in Egypt. *The business and management review*, volume 9 number 3.
- Muralitharan S., Muhammad S.S., Yuvaraj G. & Yudi, F. (2019). Manufacturing outsourcing to achieve organizational performance through manufacturing integrity capabilities. Fgic 2nd conference on governance and integrity 2019, KNE social sciences, 858–871.
- Mwangi, J.K. (2017). The effect of human resource outsourcing on organizational performance: a case study of post bank Kenya ltd. Research project presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for award of degree of master of public administration. Department of human resource school of business and economics Murang'a University of technology.
- Mtsweni, K., Mokwena, S.N. & Moeti, M.N. (2021). The impact of outsourcing information technology services on business operations. *South African journal of information management*. Issn: (online) 1560-683x, (print) 2078-186.
- Nkasirim, O.C. & Onuoha, B.C. (2018). Outsourcing strategies and organizational effectiveness of oil companies in rivers state. *International journal of management science and business administration* 4, (5), 14-22
- Okoye, M.C. (2021). Outsourcing strategies and organizational performance of fast foods in Anambra state, Nigeria. *International journal of innovative social sciences & humanities research* 9(1):65-78,
- Opuene, K.A. And H. Ejo-Orusa, H. (2020). Business process outsourcing and organizational performance of money deposit banks in Port Harcourt, Rivers State. *Academic scholars publishing league . International Journal of Management Sciences*. 8, (1) 33 – 49.
- Patil, S. (2020). Impact of human resource outsourcing on the performance of manufacturing industries. *International journal of humanities and social science invention*. 9 (8),57-60
- Rehema, B.K. & Rugami, M. (2018). Effect of outsourcing on organization performance among commercial banks in Mombasa County, Kenya. *International journal of contemporary aspects in strategic management*.2, (1), 268- 279
- Sola, K.T., Unachukwu, J.C. & Okegbemi, F.A. (2018). Exploring the relationship between strategic outsourcing and organisational performance: A study of Nigerian insurance companies. *South Asian journal of social studies and economics* 2(2): 1-8,
- Vittika, M. (2018). Outsourcing Accounting Functions -Measuring Benefits, Impact on Capabilities and Firm Performance. Master's Thesis. Oulu Business School
- Yakie, E.F. & Tamunomiebi, M.D. (2020). Outsourcing and Organisational Efficiency of Issues in Nigeria: Rivers State University as a Case Study. *International Journal of Management Technology*.7,(1), 20-30
- Yanit, T. (2020). Effects of Outsourcing Employees on Organizational Performance in Commercial Bank of Ethiopia. Thesis Submitted To School Of Graduate Studies of Addis Ababa University in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for Award of Degree of Master Human Resource and Management.